



CENTRE FOR QUALITY ASSESSMENT IN HIGHER EDUCATION

EVALUATION REPORT
STUDY FIELD of TOURISM AND LEISURE
at Šv. IGNACO LOJOLOS KOLEGIJA

Expert panel:

1. Dr. Florian Aubke, *(panel chairperson), member of academic community;*
2. Associate prof. dr. Henri Kuokkanen, *member of academic community;*
3. Associate prof. dr. Rong Huang, *member of academic community;*
4. Associate prof. dr. Dalia Prakapienė, *representative of social partners;*
5. *Ms Skaistė Kairytė, students' representative.*

Evaluation coordinator – *Ms Jūratė Čergelienė*

Report language – English

© Centre for Quality Assessment in Higher Education

Study Field Data*

Title of the study programme	Hospitality Management
State code	653N80011
Type of studies	College studies
Cycle of studies	First cycle (undergraduate)
Mode of study and duration (in years)	Full time, 3-year studies
Credit volume	180
Qualification degree and (or) professional qualification	Professional Bachelor in Business Management
Language of instruction	Lithuanian
Minimum education required	Secondary education
Registration date of the study programme	23-04-2014

** if there are **joint** / **two-fields** / **interdisciplinary** study programmes in the study field, please designate it in the foot-note*

CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION	4
1.1. BACKGROUND OF THE EVALUATION PROCESS	4
1.2. EXPERT PANEL	4
1.3. GENERAL INFORMATION	5
1.4. BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY FIELD/STUDY FIELD POSITION/STATUS AND SIGNIFICANCE IN THE HEI	5
II. GENERAL ASSESSMENT	6
III. STUDY FIELD ANALYSIS	7
3.1. INTENDED AND ACHIEVED LEARNING OUTCOMES AND CURRICULUM	7
3.2. LINKS BETWEEN SCIENCE (ART) AND STUDIES	16
3.3. STUDENT ADMISSION AND SUPPORT	20
3.4. TEACHING AND LEARNING, STUDENT PERFORMANCE AND GRADUATE EMPLOYMENT	24
3.5. TEACHING STAFF	28
3.6. LEARNING FACILITIES AND RESOURCES	32
3.7. STUDY QUALITY MANAGEMENT AND PUBLIC INFORMATION	33
IV. EXAMPLES OF EXCELLENCE	37
V. RECOMMENDATIONS*	38
VI. SUMMARY	41

I. INTRODUCTION

1.1. BACKGROUND OF THE EVALUATION PROCESS

The evaluation of study fields is based on the Methodology of External Evaluation of Study Fields approved by the Director of the Centre for Quality Assessment in Higher Education (hereafter – SKVC) 31 December 2019 Order [No. V-149](#).

The evaluation is intended to help higher education institutions to constantly improve their study process and to inform the public about the quality of studies.

The evaluation process consists of the main following stages: 1) *self-evaluation and self-evaluation report prepared by Higher Education Institution (hereafter – HEI)*; 2) *site visit of the expert panel to the higher education institution*; 3) *production of the external evaluation report (EER) by the expert panel and its publication*; 4) *follow-up activities*.

On the basis of this external evaluation report of the study field SKVC takes a decision to accredit study field either for 7 years or for 3 years. If the field evaluation is negative then the study field is not accredited.

The study field and cycle are **accredited for 7 years** if all evaluation areas are evaluated as exceptional (5 points), very good (4 points) or good (3 points).

The study field and cycle are **accredited for 3 years** if one of the evaluation areas was evaluated as satisfactory (2 points).

The study field and cycle are **not accredited** if at least one of evaluation areas was evaluated as unsatisfactory (1 point).

1.2. EXPERT PANEL

The expert panel was assigned according to the Experts Selection Procedure (hereinafter referred to as the Procedure) as approved by the Director of Centre for Quality Assessment in Higher Education on 31 December 2019 [Order No. V-149](#). The online site visit to the HEI was conducted by the panel on *May 18, 2022*.

Dr. Florian Aubke, *Head of study programs „Tourism & Hospitality Management” at University of Applied Sciences for Management and Communication, FHWien (Austria)*;

Associate prof. dr. Henri Kuokkanen, *Academic vice dean at Paul Bocuse Institute France*);

Associate prof. dr. Rong Huang, *professor at Plymouth University (United Kingdom)*;

Associate prof. dr. Dalia Prakapienė, *professor at General Jonas Žemaitis Military Academy of Lithuania, tour leader and guide of “Novaturas”, “Kelionių laikas”*;

Ms Skaistė Kairytė, *first cycle student of Organisational Communication and Marketing at Šiauliai State College (Lithuania)*.

1.3. GENERAL INFORMATION

The documentation submitted by the HEI follows the outline recommended by SKVC. Along with the self-evaluation report and annexes, the following additional documents have been provided by the HEI before, during and/or after the site visit:

No.	Name of the document
1.	On the provision of additional information (SD-59.PDF)
2.	On the provision of additional information (SD-55.PDF)
3.	Annex 2_SD55
4.	Annex1_SD55
5.	1_Priedas.pdf
6.	2_Priedas.pdf

1.4. BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY FIELD/STUDY FIELD POSITION/STATUS AND SIGNIFICANCE IN THE HEI

St. Ignatius of Loyola University of Applied Sciences (hereinafter – ILK, College), code 302485644, is a non-governmental higher education institution of the Republic of Lithuania, registered on March 2, 2010. The College is a public legal entity, functioning as a public institution. ILK is the first Jesuit institution of higher education in Lithuania. It aims at training highly qualified specialists in line with current labour market demands who, upon award of the professional bachelor's qualification degree, would be capable of successful integration into the labour market and active participation in the society following the universal and Christian values in their activity. As part of implementation of its mission, the College aims at harmonious coordination of the needs of society with the Ignatian pedagogical paradigm.

ILK has two departments: Social Welfare and Arts, Health Sciences and Technology. Currently, College offers 8 first-cycle professional bachelor's study programmes. Since 2014, Hospitality Management programme (hereinafter – the HM programme) has been offered in the field of Tourism and Leisure studies. Since 2016, the HM programme has been assigned to the Department of Welfare and Arts. Other programmes at ILK include Social Work, Pastoral Care, Image Design, Emergency Medical Care, Beauty Therapy and Culinary Arts.

In terms of student population, the HM programme contributes about 1/6 students. According to the Self-Evaluation Report (hereinafter - SER) ILK has 366 students (in October 2020: 61 of them are in the HM programme (24 first year, 19 second year).

II. GENERAL ASSESSMENT

Tourism and Leisure study field and first cycle at Šv. Ignaco Lojolos kolegija (ILK) is given **positive** evaluation.

Study field and cycle assessment in points by evaluation areas

No.	Evaluation Area	Evaluation of an Area in points*
1.	Intended and achieved learning outcomes and curriculum	2
2.	Links between science (art) and studies	2
3.	Student admission and support	3
4.	Teaching and learning, student performance and graduate employment	3
5.	Teaching staff	4
6.	Learning facilities and resources	3
7.	Study quality management and public information	3
	Total:	20

*1 (unsatisfactory) - there are essential shortcomings that must be eliminated;

2 (satisfactory) - meets the established minimum requirements, needs improvement;

3 (good) - the field is being developed systematically, has distinctive features;

4 (very good) - the field is evaluated very well in the national and international context, without any deficiencies;

5 (excellent) - the field is exceptionally good in the national and international context/environment.

III. STUDY FIELD ANALYSIS

3.1. INTENDED AND ACHIEVED LEARNING OUTCOMES AND CURRICULUM

Study aims, outcomes and content shall be assessed in accordance with the following indicators:

3.1.1. Evaluation of the conformity of the aims and outcomes of the field and cycle study programmes to the needs of the society and/or the labour market (not applicable to HEIs operating in exile conditions)

(1) Factual situation

The HM programme was started at the Department of Social Welfare September 1st., 2014. Since the September 21, 2016 Board meeting (Minutes No. 9), the HM programme has been assigned to the Department of Social Welfare and Arts. In 2018, when the required number of entrants was not reached, a detailed analysis of the need for hospitality specialists was launched, which prompted the ILK and the HM Programme Study Committee to review the content of the programme and develop a new strategy to attract entrants. In this way, the content of the HM programme was updated and the strategy for publicising the programme in multiple regions was prepared.

As revealed in the SER (p. 8), the aim of the HM programme is to prepare a hospitality management specialist who, in accordance with Christian values, faith, honesty, community and respect, sustainable development and social responsibility, will be able to assess the infrastructure of the tourism area, analyse market needs, develop and implement sustainable tourism packages, organise and manage tourism, provide services, address emerging challenges in accommodation, catering, SPA and leisure services, and to enable the specialist to pursue independent professional activities and lifelong learning. The details of the associated learning outcomes for the HM programme are presented in Table 1 (SER, p. 8-9).

The ILK (SER, p. 8) emphasises that the updated HM programme includes study subjects that help to acquire knowledge and develop practical skills in the fields of ecotourism, cultural tourism, leisure and event organisation, organisation of educational events, tourism market research, business leadership, additional foreign languages (Russian and German), provision of tourism and recreation services. The HM programme focuses on building skills for sustainable tourism development.

Within the SER, the Lithuanian Tourism Development 2014 – 2020 programme is the only official key document considered by the ILK when they examine the conformity of the aims and outcomes of the HM programme to the needs of the society and the labour market. However, the information from the employers and the Lithuanian Employment Service (SER, p. 11) are also reviewed. During the meeting with senior management and faculty administration, they emphasised that within their review and revision of the curriculum, social partners were regularly consulted to understand the new societal needs, add new contents to the Programme to ensure the programme is current. Furthermore, increasing the

student number of this HM programme during the pandemic is clear evidence that the revised programme is consistent with the needs of the labour market.

(2) Expert judgement/indicator analysis

An analysis of the HM programme aims and the intended learning outcomes, the graduates of this revised programme can develop tourism and hospitality businesses based on the principles of sustainable tourism. The revised HM programme is relevant to the regional labour market as its increasing number of the students even during the difficult time demonstrate such relevancy. However, the ILK's reconsideration of the society's needs is contained within Lithuanian context (i.e., one national strategy, regional social partner consultations). No consideration of the wider societal needs is provided.

Based on the available evidence, the review panel concludes that the aims and the learning outcomes of the revised HM programme conform with the needs of the society and the labour market. However, the review panel **recommends** that the HM programme team considers a wide range of strategies at national, European and international level to further develop its HM programme to ensure it conforms with the wider societal needs and the labour market, subsequently making its graduates more competitive in the industry and its programme more attractive.

3.1.2. Evaluation of the conformity of the field and cycle study programme aims and outcomes with the mission, objectives of activities and strategy of the HEI

(1) Factual situation

As a non-governmental Catholic higher education institution, ILK aims to conduct studies that integrate science and business under the auspices of the Jesuit St. Ignatius' educational paradigm. Hence, the promotion of Christian values (such as Faith, Honesty, Respect, Communion), the development of social responsibility is also embedded in the curriculum. Subsequently, the mission of ILK as shown in the SER (p. 12) emphasises St. Ignatius' pedagogical paradigm as a way of educating and carrying out the activities of a Jesuit educational and scientific institution.

There are five strategic goals for ILK (2012-2020) including: qualitative development of studies; development of applied research; development of material and financial resources; staff development; implementation of a quality management system. Further evidence is provided during the visit in relation to strategic plans of ILK for 2021-2025 (SD-55). They include six aspects: to provide high-quality contemporary higher education at ILK; to develop the internationality of the ILK's activities; to develop interdisciplinary applied research and professional arts; to develop the competencies of the Ignatian pedagogical paradigm at the systemic level; to maintain conditions for students to develop practical and entrepreneurial skills during their studies; to promote the international and societal experience of the community.

(2) Expert judgement/indicator analysis

An analysis of the aim and study learning outcomes of the HM programme which shown in the SER (p. 10-11) indicate that they correlate with the aims of ILK's activities. More specifically, examples include 1. ILK shall provide high-quality, progress-oriented studies that develop community spirituality and ensure the growth of professionalism of trained specialists. 2. ILK conducts research whose goals are in line with the development of society. 3. ILK develops community spirit, cooperation, tolerance and responsibility among staff and students 4. ILK shall recruit the best professionals committed to serving others 5. ILK shall support education and lifelong learning. 6. Christian values are fostered in ILK, St. Ignatius Loyola's pedagogical paradigm is implemented accordingly.

Table 2 (p. 12-13) provides a clear explanation how HM programme corresponds with five strategic goals of the ILK (2012-2020). The six aspects of new strategic goals of ILK are further development of its previous strategic goals. Interdisciplinary applied research and internationality are apparent in the key set of the strategic plans. In consideration of the revised HM programme aim and learning outcomes, they are closely related with the new strategic goals of ILK.

Based on the available evidence and the visit, therefore, the review panel concludes that the aims and the learning outcomes of the HM programme directly correlate with the mission, objectives and strategic goals of ILK.

3.1.3. Evaluation of the compliance of the field and cycle study programme with legal requirements

(1) Factual situation

Annex 1 presents the study plan of the HM programme (SER, p. 59-62) which includes all the modules. Table 3 (SER, p. 14-15) summarises credits of different elements of the HM programme in relation to requirements listed in the „Description of the general requirements for the first level and continuous degree granting study programmes“.

Table 4 (SER, p. 16) presents the distribution of the study load of the HM programme. Studies are carried out for 6 semesters (3 years). The distribution of workload in semesters is equal to 7 subjects, the total volume of which is 30 credits per semester, the minimum number of credits is 3, the maximum is 6. Internships in the HM programme include 30 credits (6 credits each, divided by semesters), and are focused on practical training and specific practical activities. The students in Programme need to successfully complete a 9-credit professional bachelor's thesis before they can be awarded with the degree.

The HM programme internships are an integral part of the programme as indicated in the SER and Annex 1 including five internship modules: Cognitive practice; Tourism Management Internship, Hotel Management Internship, Restaurant Management Internship, Final Internship (total for internships: 30 credits). Furthermore, ILK indicates in the additional information (SD-55), many modules (e.g., Hospitality Business Management, Human Resource

Management, Accounting of Finance or Food Services) contain hours of practice which is dedicated to the preparation for practice. The sum of all the practical hours in the study modules (1020 hours as shown in Annex 1) contains 38 credits. Hence, internships and other practical training of HM programme (68 credits in total) make up at least one third of the HM programme.

Annex 1 (SER, p. 59-62) indicates that learning hours at ILK include theoretical classes, practical classes, independent work and consultations. In total, contact hours (including theoretical classes and consultation classes) for HM programme are 1660hours, this means that 34.6% of the total learning hours are contact hours. Total independent hours are 2120 hours, this means that 44.2%.

(2) Expert judgement/indicator analysis

An analysis of the credit distribution among different modules listed in Annex 1, Table 3 and the additional information provided by ILK indicates that credit distribution and internship arrangement of the HM programme complies with legal requirements in regard to a Professional Bachelor degree. Furthermore, the number of contact hours corresponds to HM study programme is 34.6% of the total learning hours (4800hrs) which is more than 20%, the scope of a student's individual learning (44.2%) which is more than 30% as required for the first cycle studies in General requirements for the provision of studies.

Based on the available evidence and the visit, therefore, the review panel concludes that the HM programme complies with legal requirements.

3.1.4. Evaluation of compatibility of aims, learning outcomes, teaching/learning and assessment methods of the field and cycle study programmes

(1) Factual situation

In order to achieve the goal of the HM programme, nine specific study results are provided that correspond to the parts of the study level description (knowledge and application, ability to conduct research, special skills, social skills, personal skills) for the HM programme. During the meeting with staff responsible for preparing SER, ILK indicates that the students are expected to learn different hospitality related knowledge (e.g., food, restaurant, hotels etc), and different module contents.

The meeting with the teaching staff reveals that regular updates of the module descriptions with new sources and contribution from international colleagues through academic mobilities are two ways to ensure the newest and advanced knowledge is shared with the students.

Depending on the study goals, expected study results and general and special competencies required for a hospitality management specialist, various teaching and learning methods are applied by the lecturers in the study process. The SER provides explanations to different methods which the teaching staff teach and guide their students. Table 5 (SER, p.17) uses two subjects 'Lithuanian Tourism Resources' and 'Recreation Services' to illustrate their efforts to

ensure relationships among study results, subject results, their topics and study methods are clearly defined and consistently applied.

The internationality of ILK's activities is emphasised in its strategic priorities 2021-2025 (SD-55). Priorities of Internationalisation strategy (SD-59) provide further explanation how ILK intends to achieve internationalisation.

The forms of assessment used in study subjects are various as indicated in the SER (p. 18), e.g., defences of individual and group / course projects, presentations, colloquial reports, passing an exam, etc. These are interim and / or final settlements. Intermediate reports include colloquial and laboratory work results, tests, homework, and other tasks. Final settlements include exams, except for internships and final theses.

Four module descriptions are provided by ILK during the visit as requested (Annex 2 – SD55). They are associated with modules entitled Accounting and Finance, Tourism Services and Infrastructure, Tourism Management Practice, Development of educational programmes. All the module descriptions clearly explained the module aims, module contents, links between the study results of the programme and the results of study subjects and the methods of assessment of studies and student achievements. They also provide students with clearly defined criteria for assessments, literature and information sources.

(2) Expert judgement/indicator analysis

Although the SER indicates that the study results have been formulated taking into account the requirements of the sixth qualification level of the Lithuanian Qualifications Framework (p.8-9), a review of the study results, no information is provided in relation to knowledge and one point is provided regarding the application. Although the first programme study result implies the knowledge requirement, it refers to general knowledge which is consistent with associated study subjects. No specific subject knowledge (e.g., hospitality related topics) is mentioned. Although the ILK staff provided answers with the topics and the module contents, their answers were not well articulated to cover relevant knowledge associated with the revised HM programme. Therefore, the review panel **recommends** that the HM programme team examines the specific subject knowledge which is included in the programme and add suitable knowledge statements to the current HM programme study results.

A range of modules is included in the study plan in the SER (see Annex 1, p.59-62) including general study subjects, - field subjects, internships, optional subjects and final thesis as shown in Table 4 (p. 15). Although the HM programme is entitled Hospitality Management, a review of the module contents and module titles, only eight modules are directly related to hospitality. Although sustainable tourism is emphasised, limited contextualisation of such practice in hospitality businesses. Furthermore, some hospitality contents such as front office management, revenue management, resort development and management are not considered. A review of optional modules, none of them is directly associated with hospitality management. Therefore, the review panel **recommends** that the HM programme team considers (a) renaming different study subjects to ensure they reflect actual subject contents;

(b) adding more hospitality related module contents; (c) rebranding the programme as Tourism and Hospitality Management to reflect the current module contents.

The internationality is emphasised in ILK's strategic plan and the priorities of internationalisation strategy are sensible. More modules to be taught in English are a good approach to achieve internationality. However, a review of the current study plan of the HM programme reveals that the current study plan lacks international focus, and no modules explicitly relate with international context. Therefore, the review panel **recommends** that the HM programme team reconsiders its curriculum and add international contents (e.g., trends and issues in international hospitality industry, human resource management issues in an international context, international marketing, etc) to the study plan.

In relation to the newest knowledge required by the field of tourism and leisure study, a review of the four module descriptions reveals that literature sources which are recommended for students to read are not up to date. Most of them are published before 2014. Therefore, the review panel **recommends** that the HM programme teaching staff take annual review of different module descriptions to ensure up to date literature sources are recommended for students to read and study.

Table 1 in the SER (p. 8) and SD55_Annex 1 interfaces between the results of the HM programme and the study subjects provide clear information about how the study results (Learning outcomes) are achieved through different modules. The SER (section 1.4, p. 17) reveals that HM programme team ensures that subject topics correspond to the objectives of the subjects, which are in line with the goal and the study results of the programme. Furthermore, clear explanations are provided in the four module descriptions (Annex 2 - SD55) which demonstrate in an excellent manner that HM programme staff consider study goals, the study results of the HM programme and the subjects to design its teaching and assessment. Teaching and assessment methods are suitable for the module contents they apply to.

Based on the available evidence, the visit and the additional information, despite the weaknesses identified above, the review panel is satisfied that the aims and learning outcomes of HM programme are compatible with teaching/learning and assessment methods of the programme.

3.1.5. Evaluation of the totality of the field and cycle study programme subjects/modules, which ensures consistent development of competences of students

(1) Factual situation

The SER indicates that HM study programme includes two main fields: theoretical preparation of students (knowledge) and practical training / internship (skills), which gives the specialist the opportunity to reflect on his / her activities professionally and to establish transferable skills. Annex 1 in the SER presents the study subjects associated with the HM programme.

Three principles are followed when the HM programme team arranges the subjects in the programme (SER, p.18-19). They are the principle of directionality, the principle of practical unity, and the principle of equality of studies, transferability of competencies and expediency.

The HM programme includes both internships and practical professional preparation as explained in section 3.1.3 above. ILK's internship organisation procedure is followed in organising the internship. To complete the study programme, the students are required to successfully complete a professional bachelor's thesis.

(2) Expert judgement/indicator analysis

An analysis of Annex 1 in the SER and Annex 1 (SD-55) indicates that HM programme team considers two key aspects of competences for its students to demonstrate. An analysis of the order of the subjects reveals that the scope of subjects in credits, their place in the study plan and chronology is based on the correlation, integration and continuity of the expected study results.

The meeting with the students indicates that they are happy with what they learned so far. The meeting with social partners and employers suggest that they are impressed with the mature attitude, work ethics and quality of the internship students/graduates from ILK.

In consideration of this evidence, the review panel agrees that the HM programme is developed to ensure the students to gain theoretical knowledge, the acquisition of abilities, and be able to perform during practical activities. Therefore, the review panel concludes that the totality of HM programme ensures consistent development of competences of the students.

3.1.6. Evaluation of opportunities for students to personalise the structure of field study programmes according to their personal learning objectives and intended learning outcomes

(1) Factual situation

There are three ways which ILK students can personalise their study:

- (a) Optional modules: the students need to choose and complete five optional modules during their study of HM programme. Annex 1 in the SER (p.59-62) reveals that ILK offers 11 optional modules for its students to choose.
- (b) Individual study plan: students are given the opportunity to individualise their studies according to their learning difficulties (if any), and the competencies they have acquired during the previous learning period.

The Description of the Procedure for Providing an Individualised Study / Learning Plan regulates the procedure of individual studies at ILK (V-51PRIED-1). Orientation of the HM programme to remote regions and the formation of two groups / courses of HM students and the possibility of individualised studies has gained great importance. The MOODLE platform

provides the students the opportunity to participate in lectures at a distance, and listen to lectures according to the individualised study plan.

(c) Academic mobility opportunities: in 2013, ILK was awarded an Erasmus+ Higher Education Charter, so its staff and students can take part in the Erasmus+ mobility programme.

The international mobility of ILK students during the analysed period 2017-2020 was funded by the European Union Structural Funds and the European Commission (KA103). All information about the importance and benefits of Erasmus +, the process, the opportunities, and the experience of the participants is available on ILK's website. Throughout the mobility period, students receive all the necessary support and coordination from the Erasmus + Coordinator. For hospitality management students, foreign partners offer various fields and activities in the hospitality sector, especially in Italy, Spain, Greece, Cyprus and Malta.

However, the SER (p. 35) reveals that for the last two academic years, most of HM programme students could not go to other countries for at least two months due to their family responsibilities and work commitment in Lithuanian hospitality industry. In order to increase the international mobility of such students, ILK has adopted three measures: 1) establishing contacts with new partners who can offer internships outside the main season; 2) search for new, more convenient directions with existing partners; 3) increase of opportunities for short-term and mixed Erasmus mobility visits (SER, p. 35).

(2) Expert judgement/indicator analysis

In relation to optional modules, the HM programme students have a range of different options to choose. However a review of those optional modules indicates that these modules are mainly associated with tourism in general and foreign language. None of them are associated with the hospitality sector in particular.

As for the individual study plan, the meeting with the students reveals that many mature students who have other commitments in the remote regions appreciated the support and opportunities they gained during their study of the HM programme. They were aware of different opportunities they got. Different examples provided by the students during the meeting demonstrate these mature students are able to adjust the study plan in relation to their personal circumstance. They were particularly happy that they could take internship activities in their own regions and complete meaningful final projects to achieve the required study results.

The meeting with the teaching staff demonstrates that the staff are aware of the procedures to manage the individual study plan. The study results (intended learning outcomes), and the previous good performance of the student are key considerations for lecturers to decide whether a student is suitable for the individual study plan. ILK's increasing recruitment number is a good testimonial to the success of management of the individual study plan.

As far as academic mobility opportunities, ILK ensures such opportunities are promoted to its students and the information is readily accessible. ILK clearly understands the issues around its mature student cohort, proactive measures are planned for 2022 and beyond.

Based on the available evidence, the student feedback and proactive actions which ILK initiated, the review panel **commends** that HM programme team made an excellent effort to manage the individual study plan of their students according to their personal learning objectives and the study results.

3.1.7. Evaluation of compliance of final theses with the field and cycle requirements

(1) Factual situation

The purpose of the final thesis (project) in ILK is to enable the student to develop deeper knowledge, understanding, abilities and attitudes in the context of the Programme. The final thesis is worth 9 credits. The final thesis of the HM programme consists of two parts: the descriptive (theoretical) part and the practical part - recommendations and suggestions for solving the specific problem analysed in the final thesis. Annex 2 in the SER (p. 63) provides a list of final thesis topics, details of thesis supervisors and final grades. Furthermore, 10 theses are included to provide further evidence.

As indicated in the SER (p. 20), the final thesis is only defended after completing all the subjects provided in the HM programme and passing all the assessments, and completing all professional practice in the sixth semester.

Final theses at ILK are evaluated by a qualification commission of at least 5 members, which consists of: representatives of employers (at least half of the commission members), one of whom is appointed chairman of the commission, and at least one lecturer responsible for the implementation of the HM programme.

(2) Expert judgement/indicator analysis

The final theses correspond to the content and parameters (title, research relevance, research objectives, data collection and analysis methods, presentation of results, conclusions) for tourism and recreation studies.

As can be seen from the theses in the list included in Annex 2 and 10 additional theses, the themes correspond to the direction of Tourism and Recreation. Most of them were focused on the development of hospitality services or infrastructure provided in resorts and resort areas, introduction, improvement and marketing of new services (or service packages). Therefore, the review panel concludes that the final theses of HM study programme comply with first cycle requirements.

Strengths and weaknesses of this evaluation area:

(1) Strengths:

1. HM programme team made an excellent effort to manage the individual study plan of their students according to their personal learning objectives and the study results.

(2) Weaknesses:

1. Limited consideration of wider societal needs and the labour market demands.
2. Although teaching staff demonstrate sufficient knowledge of different topics to cover in the HM programme, knowledge requirements for the programme are not clearly articulated in the study results.
3. There is a lack of hospitality related contents (core and optional modules) in the HM programme.
4. Except foreign languages, a review of the study plan and the module descriptions reveals that there is limited international focus in the current HM programme.
5. Outdated literature sources are included in different module descriptions which form barriers for students to gain the newest knowledge and advanced skills.

3.2. LINKS BETWEEN SCIENCE (ART) AND STUDIES

Links between science (art) and study activities shall be assessed in accordance with the following indicators:

3.2.1. Evaluation of the sufficiency of the science (applied science, art) activities implemented by the HEI for the field of research (art) related to the field of study

(1) Factual situation

The title of the programme is Hospitality Management. However, faculty publications do not align well with this topic area; this is particularly true for the only two international publications indicated to be in EBSCO-indexed sources at the end of the list. These focus on intellectual leadership of researchers and nursing. Similarly, several of the topics highlighted in the SER (p. 24-25) revolve around fake information, mathematics learning and innovation, while some others are in the field of tourism. These are interesting areas, but they are not in the field of the HM programme itself.

According to the report the “vast majority” of ILK lecturers do not perform research. However, the report insinuates that some of the lecturers have worked on research while not working for ILK; no evidence on such activity is offered and such notes come across as questionable. Beyond this, the SER only states that ILK is working on a strategy and

motivational framework to engage faculty in research. However, no factual evidence or examples are mentioned. During the remote site visit, some faculty stated getting 4 hours a week to conduct research, but there seemed to be no exact consensus on this. Indeed, only two faculty members, when polled, had published a journal article or a book chapter, or presented in a scientific conference outside the country.

In terms of the scholarship of teaching and learning, it appears that the institution organises a number of events for faculty development, and some of the research mentioned in the report is relevant to this field. The institution makes a choice to include Christian values in its education, and this aspect is evident also in teacher development. Within the report, these values are defined slightly differently when referred to in different occasions (p. 12: Faith, Honesty, Respect, Communion; p. 21: faith, honesty, community and respect). However, when faculty was asked about these values during the remote site visit, the answer included internal search and development, and excellence in life and work.

To conclude, this section describes the links between science and hospitality management through 3 bullet points in the SER (p. 26). The two first points do not appear to connect with hospitality management in any way, and the third argues that research knowledge is integrated into two hospitality specific courses without offering evidence of the research projects in question or the integration itself.

(2) Expert judgement/indicator analysis

As such, faculty having a wide range of research interests that sometimes deviate from the core subject is not a problem. However, it appears that in the case of ILK, faculty research that focuses on the core subject of the HM programme is mostly missing. This is a serious worry for an institution for which, during the last review, a recommendation was to incentivize faculty to research more. It seems that such work has been seriously delayed. There is an urgent need to direct research activities to focus on hospitality management.

The previous panel also recommended ILK to clarify its Christian values among its stakeholders. In this respect, the institution seems to not have achieved the goal, considering that the values named by the institution and its faculty deviated from each other.

3.2.2. Evaluation of the link between the content of studies and the latest developments in science, art and technology

(1) Factual situation

According to the SER, "ILK aims to strengthen the link between science and studies by helping students to acquire unique knowledge and skills". The report itself and the remote site visit did not offer further evidence on how this is pursued or achieved. Of the six modules mentioned as examples, only two focus on hospitality, and the rest on tourism. The report also discussed participation in a national chef competition, culinary arts studio and beauty

programme as evidence of this link. While the world of culinary arts naturally connects with hospitality management in terms of food and beverage outlets and foodservice business, these are separate study fields that should be covered by different study programmes. No further detail is provided on how this is linked with the study area of hospitality management. Furthermore, practical evidence in this section is scarce, with few factual evidence limiting itself to the two examples mentioned in this paragraph.

The remote site visit did not offer further evidence on this link, and the interaction with social partners came across as rather one-sided (dictated by the institution). No other examples of applied research emerged during the visit, and the social partners highlighted the aforementioned detection of fake news as the foremost research example.

(2) Expert judgement/indicator analysis

Considering that the area of the programme is hospitality management and does not mention tourism, it is very alarming that so much of the course content revolves around tourism and so little focuses on hospitality. While there is evidence of research and links between science and practice in the field of tourism, this is not adequate to support the HM programme. During the remote site visit the management of ILK stated very clearly what hospitality management refers to, removing any doubt of misunderstanding the field, but implementing this knowledge in action appears to be lacking behind.

The notion of offering unique knowledge at the level of bachelor studies is, in its own right, somewhat disconcerting. At this level, students need a solid set of basic skills and competencies that allow them to not only place themselves in the professional world but also continue self-development after their study programme is over. For this, a strong set of basic hospitality management skills and competencies is needed, complemented by frameworks such as the OECD 21st century skills or similar.

Finally, this section of the report suffers from a serious lack of factual evidence and practical examples that would support the adequacy of activities. Most of the written section describes correct approaches and uses the right terminology, but practical application is not evident. The same situation was evident during the remote site visits, supporting this evaluation.

3.2.3. Evaluation of conditions for students to get involved in scientific (applied science, art) activities consistent with their study cycle

(1) Factual situation

The opportunities for the students to engage in research appear satisfactory based on the examples provided in the SER. Similarly, the thesis topics revolve around the field of the HM programme, as indicated in the annex. The remote site visit supported this notion and in general, the students seem aware of the opportunities at hand.

During the remote site visit, when students were invited to share their experiences and examples related to research and other topics, the students seemed incapable of spontaneously answering the questions. While this could have been a language issue, it was always possible to get the questions interpreted in Lithuanian. When asked, the students, instead, explained that they were afraid of forgetting something important, and, therefore, they needed to agree on an answer in advance.

(2) Expert judgement/indicator analysis

Student access and exposure to research and research information is an important component of a study programme at this level. The evidence provided supports the notion that this aspect is adequately incorporated in the HM programme, although the trend of tourism and recreation, instead of hospitality management, is also partially evident in the topics of the final theses. This, as such, does not suggest an outright flaw, but is still something that should be taken seriously in future development.

The inability of the students to react and answer questions that require analysis in a spontaneous manner raises a question on why they needed to discuss all the answers before one of them would answer. Subsequently, many of the answers were quite technical. The purpose of the site visits is to share experiences rather than give “correct” answers, and students at this level should be capable of independent thinking and analysis. This could indicate that such skills have not been adequately incorporated in the HM programme, particularly through independent research activity. A confident student with solid learning during their programme is able to express these learnings or mention some of them, while knowing that other students will complement their answers. It is always possible that the students were under the impression that the site visit was, in fact, something akin to an examination, in which case the institution must work toward making sure that the students fully comprehend the purpose and nature of the site visits.

Strengths and weaknesses of this evaluation area:

(1) Strengths:

None

(2) Weaknesses:

1. Across this section, the report lacks factual evidence and practical, hospitality management evidence. While the narrative used to describe practices often uses the appropriate vocabulary, it is impossible to evaluate whether these descriptions reflect reality in light of this lack of evidence.
2. Research activities in the institution seem unsystematic, including the manner in which faculty is encouraged and rewarded for research that appears unclear.
3. While there is a limited but adequate amount of publication, this publication, at least the highlighted and the international articles, are outside the core area of the HM programme.

4. The student body comes across as lacking self-confidence and/or critical thinking skills; alternatively, they had misunderstood the nature of the site visit as an examination.
5. The link with social partners in research must be strengthened, and social partner input should give more guidance to research projects in the institution. This, naturally, relies on social partners that are from the hospitality industry.

3.3. STUDENT ADMISSION AND SUPPORT

Student admission and support shall be evaluated according to the following indicators:

3.3.1. Evaluation of the suitability and publicity of student selection and admission criteria and process

(1) Factual situation

The admission to the College is centralised and is carried out pursuant to the information system of the Lithuanian Higher Institutions Association for Organizing Joint Admission (LAMA BPO), by general provisions of the Lithuanian Higher Institutions Association and Student Admission Rules and institutional admission by the College. The entry requirements of the College are consistent with the National regulations. In addition, ILK has implemented a system for institutional admission to non-state-funded study places. The average competitive score of those admitted to the HM programme has been 6,42(out of a possible 10 points) in 2020 and 6,78 in 2021, respectively. The average competitive scores increased since the last programme evaluation and can now be considered on par with comparative study programmes. ILK did not admit any students to the HM programme in 2018 and 2019, which shows that the fluctuation in demand continued from the previous evaluation. On a positive note, ILK experienced an increase in admission numbers in the last two years (2020: 20, 2021: 31). This is notable, since the admissions occurred at times where many institutions experienced significant drops due to the pandemic situation and its effect on the attractiveness of tourism as a career path.

According to the SER (p. 33), the rise in admission numbers is credited to the “regional orientation of the HM programme and the marketing and communication strategy aimed at them,...”. One side-effect of this recruitment strategy is a significant increase in mature students in the HM programme (41.15 years in 2020 and 49.02 years in 2021). During the expert’s group meeting with the student representatives, no mature students were present, thus we are not able to fully assess the suitability of the HM programme for the needs of mature students. Based on the SER, the HM programme does not seem to cater for their needs in any particular way.

The drop-out-numbers remain a matter of concern. Despite the fact that this issue has already been addressed in the previous evaluation report, the management team of ILK does not appear to have implemented a structured analysis of the reasons for this, nor have student retention mechanisms been developed and implemented. During the meeting with student

representatives, personal reasons as well as immigration issues were named, but students also reported that they are not sure why the dropout is high.

(2) Expert judgement/indicator analysis

ILK's focus on attracting students from small towns and regions appears to be a successful approach for the HM programme, as it resulted in a viable demand after two years of no admissions. Being attractive for mature students may suggest that there is a real need for up-skilling in rural areas, and ILK has an opportunity to differentiate itself from competition on this factor. However, the needs and wants of employers in rural areas and mature students with (usually) more practical experience need to be addressed explicitly and appropriately in both the HM programme content and management.

The review panel is concerned by the rising dropout-rates and recommends the management of ILK to develop a retention management procedure and implement this in the institution's quality management system.

3.3.2. Evaluation of the procedure of recognition of foreign qualifications, partial studies and prior non-formal and informal learning and its application

(1) Factual situation

Recognition of qualifications gained outside of ILK (either as prior formal or non-formal qualifications) are available to students and the procedure is outlined in the SER. No information has been provided on the number of students seeking credit transfer or the scope of credit transfer that has been granted (or denied). During the expert group's meeting with student representatives none of the students had made use of credit transfer possibilities. It can be assumed that so far credit transfers stemming from academic mobility are the only use cases.

(2) Expert judgement/indicator analysis

The procedure for the recognition of formal and non-formal qualifications gained outside of ILK seems to be well defined and implemented in the HM programme management. With increased internationalisation, the use of credit transfers is likely to increase. In case ILK continues its focus on regional recruitment and recruitment of mature students, a more detailed process of recognition of non-formal qualifications should be considered.

3.3.3. Evaluation of conditions for ensuring academic mobility of students.

(1) Factual situation

According to the SER, 7-10% of students engage in international education during the reporting period. Internationalisation is a central component in hospitality management study programmes, and the necessity to internationalise further has been raised in the last evaluation report. Since, a number of agreements with higher education institutions have

been signed. Students are also provided with the opportunity to spend their internship abroad and receive financial support through the Erasmus+ Scheme.

Academic mobility of students (and staff) remains limited and the HM programme management credits this to the composition of the students body. Mature students are more often confined by professional and personal commitments than younger students, hence the willingness and ability to engage in academic mobility is limited. According to the SER (p. 34), the HM programme shall be fully internationalised by 2027, yet the management did not provide any details on what this entails. The difficulty to attract international students to ILK is due to a low number of subject specific (i.e. hospitality management) modules offered in the English language.

(2) Expert judgement/indicator analysis

The expert team recommends the HM study programme management to make the internationalisation plan more explicit, including key performance indicators for a) subjects taught at ILK in English or languages other than Lithuanian and b) students and staff engaging in academic or training mobility. A decision should be taken on how the focus on regionalization on the one hand and internationalisation on the other shall be handled and potential areas of conflict shall be dealt with.

3.3.4. Assessment of the suitability, adequacy and effectiveness of the academic, financial, social, psychological and personal support provided to the students of the field

(1) Factual situation

Students in this College receive various types of help - psychological, academic, and financial. The College actively focuses on student awareness and (Christian) values. There is a Student Council, which represents students in academic work (college councils) (p. 35-36, SER). In order to evaluate the improvement process, reflection groups are used.. Motivation and support are important in every process - ILK motivates the students with different activities - alumni clubs, events, trips. The College receives and provides all necessary support for mature students. The College takes into account students who combine study with work and provide opportunities for students to have individual study schedules (p. 33, SER).

(2) Expert judgement/indicator analysis

Students are informed and know about their support possibilities. Students actively use the support tools and channels provided by the College. If other issues or needs arise, meetings with the administration for students are offered. It is advisable that the Student Council focus more on the process of communications with students. The College provides adequate support for mature students, but is important to work towards maintaining a balance of regular and mature students.

3.3.5 Evaluation of the sufficiency of study information and student counselling

(1) Factual situation

To ensure the quality of studies, the College has a strong focus on communication. The communication process ensures that the necessary information is sent and received by both students and staff and by the non-administrative part of the college staff. Feedback is provided. If a question or need arises, the college community has the opportunity to contact the administration regarding the request.

If students do not understand the material of the subject taught by the teachers, in case of a question, or in order to use the learning resources provided by the college - various types of consultations are provided. Students have the opportunity to contact the administration through the members of the Student Council for consultations and other questions. The quality of information and consultation is ensured.

(2) Expert judgement/indicator analysis

Information on various topics is sent to students. Teachers share relevant information during the lectures. The administration communicates directly with students to inform them on study-related matters. Students have career specialists with whom they can talk and discuss their careers and other questions. During the outreach process, it is important to note that some of the required information is not available to students..

Strengths and weaknesses of this evaluation area:

(1) Strengths:

1. The quality of personal support provided at various stages of the studies.
2. Representation of students in administrative units.

(2) Weaknesses:

1. Ensuring students received information and are included in the decision-making processes at ILK.

3.4. TEACHING AND LEARNING, STUDENT PERFORMANCE AND GRADUATE EMPLOYMENT

Studying, student performance and graduate employment shall be evaluated according to the following indicators:

3.4.1. Evaluation of the teaching and learning process that enables to take into account the needs of the students and enable them to achieve the intended learning outcomes

(1) Factual situation

The organisation of the study process at the College is regulated by documents such as the Academic Council Regulation, The Description of the Procedure for the Provision of an Individualised Study/Learning Plan, The Description of the Procedure for Assessment of Study Results, The College's Study Procedures, and The Description of the Procedures for the Preparation and Defence of Final Papers (Projects).

According to the SER (p. 40) and the information received during the remote site-visit, the emphasis is on the flexible use of different study forms (full-time and part-time) and contact methods (contact - auditorium, remote learning, mixed, consulting, practical training). The College's study procedure also offers an opportunity to study according to an individual study plan which is drawn up and approved by the Head of the Department. During the remote site-visit, the students confirmed that they use this opportunity and pointed it out as an advantage of the College.

Several IT platforms are used in the organisation of the educational process: for the management of study processes and data - UNIMETIS (where students' achievements are documented); for teaching materials and feedback, and communication - Moodle and Teams platforms.

The SER states (p. 40) that students' achievements are assessed by assigning them to an excellent, typical or threshold level of study achievements according to the approved document Description of the procedure for assessment of study results which provides the principles of assessment of study results and organisation of assessment. During the remote site-visit with the teachers, it was clarified that at the beginning of each course, students are introduced to the course objectives, assignments and the assessment system. The assessment system is also presented and detailed in the description of each subject. According to the majority of ILK's students (86%), the assessment of the subjects taught at ILK is objective and comprehensive (SER p. 41). The students who attended the remote site-visit meeting confirmed their satisfaction with their studies and the assessment system.

It should be stressed that lecturers are directly involved in designing the study process. The SER states (p. 40), that the lecturer chooses the forms, content and scope of both classroom and independent work in such a way as to ensure the accessibility of the subject results.

(2) Expert judgement/indicator analysis

The process of organising the educational process is regulated and defined, and information related to the studies is available via the information platforms (UNIMETIS, Moodle and Teams). The analysis of the information received shows that the ILK administration is strongly supportive for students and flexible in adapting the study process to changes in the environment. This is confirmed by facts such as the extension of the deadline for internships during the quarantine period (Principal's Order, 2020-13-13, V-23) or the establishment of individual study plans..

The weaknesses noted in the evaluation system analysis concern the clarity and transparency of the evaluation system. Despite the existence of the official document regulating assessment, there is a lack of a direct link between the declared assessment system (excellent, typical or threshold level of study achievements) and the one presented in the course descriptions. It is also recommended that the assessment system in the course descriptions should be more detailed, not only in terms of identifying the task and its weighting, but also in terms of describing the specific nature of the assessment task, and the links to the objectives.

The analysis of the role of lecturers in the development of the course should be more formalised with clear deadlines and procedures for when and how changes should be made, and who checks and approves them. The impression gained from the remote meeting with the lecturers was that changes to the content or to the assessment system are possible at any time, even after the course has started. Therefore, it is recommended that a formal procedure for the development and approval of course descriptions be established.

3.4.2. Evaluation of conditions ensuring access to study for socially vulnerable groups and students with special needs

(1) Factual situation

The SER and the documents approved by the Principal's Order (in SER, p.40) suggest that the College takes into account socially vulnerable groups and students with special needs through measures such as exemption from the registration fee for studies, possibilities to park a car at ILK parking places, to receive mentors during studies and possibility to study according to an individual study plan. The real implementation of these measures was confirmed and very positively evaluated by a student during the remote site-visit meeting by presenting her personal experience. It should be noted that the College does not provide information in the SER on how the premises and other learning facilities are adapted for students with special needs.

(2) Expert judgement/indicator analysis

The analysis of the current situation shows that the ILK has developed a package of measures that focus on socially vulnerable groups and students with special needs and is implementing them in practice.

3.4.3. Evaluation of the systematic nature of the monitoring of student study progress and feedback to students to promote self-assessment and subsequent planning of study progress

(1) Factual situation

The monitoring of student study progress, according to the SER (p. 43), is carried out twice a year, data are systematised in the Unimetis study process and data management system. The monitoring is performed by the lecturer of the taught subject / module, the curator of the study programme and the head of the department. In case of study progress problems, individual interviews with students are organised and a support plan is drawn up. The remote site-visit with the students confirmed the students' close cooperation with both the administration and the lecturers. The students stressed constant support and access to both substantive and psychological help. They also mentioned that students can even call their lecturer on a personal phone number if needed.

Study feedback, which is an integral part of the monitoring of study progress, consists of a survey of the study module / subject and the quality of studies, a survey of the lecturers, a survey of the social partners (SER, p. 43). During the remote site visits, all interviewed groups confirmed that they had completed these questionnaires. The surveys are organised and analysed at least once a year. The lecturers confirmed during the site-visit that the students' feedback is important for them to improve the content of the subject, the choice of methods used or the change in the assessment task.

(2) Expert judgement/indicator analysis

The analysis showed that the student monitoring system is designed and implemented in a relational way through constant monitoring and continuous contact with the students.

The analysis of the feedback system used in ILK shows that the questionnaires are regularly filled out and analysed, and the results obtained are directed by the responsible units or persons to improve the study programme.

3.4.4. Evaluation of employability of graduates and graduate career tracking in the study field.

(1) Factual situation

The employment of graduates and graduate careers in the College is monitored by the curator of the study programme, the Centre for Future Professions, and the Alumni Club (based on SER, p. 41). ILK declares that it has developed its own monitoring system (a questionnaire for graduates, evaluations from social partners from the places of professional practice), which helps access the graduates. It should be noted that more than half of all the graduates are employed or self-employed after completing Hospitality Management studies (2018 – 7 from 10, 2019 – 6 from 10, 2020 – 4 from 8; Table 12). This result is due to the fact, which was also confirmed during the remote site-visit with the students, that HM programme is often chosen by students already working in the tourism sector.

(2) Expert judgement/indicator analysis

The monitoring of employability of graduates and graduate careers is carried out at ILK. The low number of students (10 students in 2018 and 2019, 8 students in 2020) and the fact that some of the students are employed in the companies managed by social partners make data collection quite simple.

3.4.5. Evaluation of the implementation of policies to ensure academic integrity, tolerance and non-discrimination

(1) Factual situation

The academic integrity, tolerance and non-discrimination at ILK is ensured through formal documentation: ILK's Code of Academic Ethics (2019 -06-14, Nr. V-70) and The St. Ignatius of Loyola University of Applied Sciences Corruption Prevention Programme 2020-2025 (2019 12-31, V-139). Students are involved in the process of implementing the academic integrity, tolerance and non-discrimination policy at the beginning of their studies: each new student of ILK signs a declaration of good faith, which is valid for the entire period of the study contract (based on ILK's Code of Academic Ethics). The implementation of the Code is carried out by an Ethics Committee formed by the order of the Director.

The SER states that, during the last three years, the students of the HM programme have not violated the Code of Ethics and no violations of academic ethics in the field of study have been reported. However, during the remote site-visit meeting with the lecturers, it was claimed that one case of dishonesty related to plagiarism of a text was still considered, but it was not confirmed.

(2) Expert judgement/indicator analysis

The process of the implementation of policies to ensure academic integrity, tolerance and non-discrimination is clear and regulated.

3.4.6. Evaluation of the effectiveness of the application of procedures for the submission and examination of appeals and complaints regarding the study process within the field studies

(1) Factual situation

The College has an approved ILK's Appeals and Complaints Procedure (2021-04-21, No V-30). Proposals for the improvement of measures to maintain academic integrity and prevent corruption are also collected anonymously. For this purpose, forms have been developed and made publicly available on ILK's website (<https://www.ilkk.lt/akademine-etika/> and <https://www.ilkk.lt/korupcijos-prevencija/>). SER states that no student appeals or complaints were filed in this field during the assessment period. However, it can be stated that during the remote site-visit discussion, the students were not aware of this possibility: they could neither name the procedure nor identify where this document could be found.

(2) Expert judgement/indicator analysis

The College has a procedure for appeals and complaints, but the students are not familiar with it. Therefore, closer communication between the administration and the students on this issue is recommended.

Strengths and weaknesses of this evaluation area:

(1) Strengths:

1. ILK responds flexibly to the needs of students by creating a supportive learning environment.
2. Close communication and support between the lecturers and the students during their studies.
3. ILK provides and exploits facilities for socially vulnerable groups and students with special needs.

(2) Weaknesses:

1. The assessment system of the subjects is of a generalised nature, without detailing the links between each task and the objectives of the subject, and without detailing the assessment according to the three levels of assessment provided.
2. Unregulated and unclear procedures for the development and approval of the subject description.
3. The students are not familiar with the procedure for appeals and complaints in the study process.

3.5. TEACHING STAFF

Study field teaching staff shall be evaluated in accordance with the following indicators:

3.5.1. Evaluation of the adequacy of the number, qualification and competence (scientific, didactic, professional) of teaching staff within a field study programme(s) at the HEI in order to achieve the learning outcomes

(1) Factual situation

At ILK, as indicated in the SER (p. 47), lecturers are employed and their activities are evaluated in accordance with the Description of the Procedure for the Certification and Competitions for Lecturers of ILK and the Description of the Minimum Qualification Requirements for the Lecturers of ILK. Visiting lecturers are employed according to the needs of the study programme. Furthermore, experienced educators, social partners and founders are invited to review and evaluate students' final theses annually.

Lecturers working in ILK as a part-time workplace combine work with practical or pedagogical activities in other institutions. ILK provides all the opportunities to flexibly coordinate the work schedules of ILK and other institutions.

The need for lecturers for the next academic year is planned in accordance with the study plans approved by the Academic Council, which reflect the study subjects in the autumn and spring semesters. The need for lecturers in the departments is adjusted at the beginning of each semester, taking into account the study subjects and the number of students.

Annex 3 in the SER (p. 64-71) presents the list of lecturers who have worked in ILK. It provides information of their qualification, fields of interest, scientific research in the past 5 years, experience in the college, academic experience, pedagogical experience, and practical work experience.

In order to ensure the quality of studies and to increase the involvement of lecturers, to promote interdisciplinarity between programs and to achieve synergies between study programs, some lecturers teach students from different programs, thus combining knowledge and experience.

(2) Expert judgement/indicator analysis

A review of Annex 3 reveals that all lecturers working in the HM programme have at least a master's degree in the field of study, and five of them have a doctoral degree. All lecturers, regardless of their workload and length of service at ILK, have more than 3 years of practical work experience. Assessing lecturers according to the principles of equal opportunities 84 percent of lecturers are women and 16 percent are made up of men. These indicators show that there is still a tendency for women to make up the majority of those working in social sciences. The number of lecturers teaching tourism and recreation studies has remained stable in recent years, with an average of 11 lecturers (see Table 13 in the SER, p. 47).

The meeting with the students indicates that they are satisfied and agree that their lecturers are qualified and experienced to teach the Programme. The number of the lecturers is adequate.

Based on the available evidence and the visit, therefore, the review panel concludes that the number, the personnel for the implementation of the tourism and recreation field complies with the requirements of legal acts, their qualification and competences of the teaching staff at ILK are sufficient and suitable for achieving the expected study results.

3.5.2. Evaluation of conditions for ensuring teaching staffs' academic mobility (not applicable to studies carried out by HEIs operating under the conditions of exile)

(1) Factual situation

ILK runs Erasmus+ KA103 projects between 2017 and 2020, which provide funding for teaching and learning visits not only for students but also for academic and administrative staff. The procedures are presented in the ILK website and are presented in general teachers' meetings at the beginning of every semester and in the emails of Erasmus coordinator.

Lecturers are actively encouraged to take advantage of Erasmus + during informational events and by email. The ILK's Erasmus + Coordinator is in active contact with partner

institutions on proposals for teaching and learning visits, which are then communicated to lecturers. Lecturers themselves are also encouraged to develop new contacts and establish cooperation with foreign institutions. The financial and other necessary support are organised following the rules of Erasmus projects and other institution's rules.

In order to attract lecturers, ILK participates in the schemes organised by the Education Exchange Support Foundation to support the visits of visiting teachers. In this case, the focus is on lecturers working in institutions in countries outside the KA103 program.

Table 14 (SER, p. 50) provides details of outgoing and incoming lecturers in the field and their share of all the lecturers in the field in the last 3 years. The meeting with the teaching staff indicates that the teaching staff are aware of different academic mobility opportunities and related application procedures. They feel that they are supported by ILK if they plan to take the mobility.

(2) Expert judgement/indicator analysis

An analysis of academic mobility information on the ILK's website, and Table 14 information in the SER indicates that ILK staff are satisfied with conditions they have in relation to academic mobility. Similar to impacts reported in the SER (p. 50), the teaching staff are positive with the support they received from ILK. People who are responsible for the SER, and the teaching staff recognise positive impacts of academic mobility to their teaching practice, research capability development and development of relationships between the partners.

Except Table 14, limited information is provided in relation to incoming academic mobility. However, ILK's internationalisation strategy does emphasise international teaching and learning exchanges and employs international lecturers.

Based on the available evidence, the visit and the additional information, the review panel concludes that the conditions for ensuring the teaching staffs' academic mobility are clear and well signposted for the staff. Benefits of academic mobility are recognised by the teaching staff and ILK.

3.5.3. Evaluation of the conditions to improve the competences of the teaching staff

(1) Factual situation

The SER (p. 50) reveals that the professional development activities of the lecturers of ILK are regulated by the Description of the Procedure for Improving the Qualification of Lecturers of ILK and other employees of ILK. Competence development activities in the College are organised taking into account the following groups of competencies: personal competencies, research competencies, foreign language competencies, intercultural competencies, subject competencies, practical competencies.

ILK has developed an appraisal system of staff (SD-59) which considers lecturer's activity report, self-assessment of the lecturer's work experience according to St. Ignatius pedagogical paradigm, assessment of lecturer's job satisfaction, student evaluation and students'

assessment of the quality of subject teaching. Overall appraisal results are discussed in the meeting of all ILK lecturers every semester. The staff annual competence development plan is developed which aims at purposeful improvement of the ILK lecturers' competencies, thus enabling lecturers to get involved in a lifelong learning process, raise qualifications on institutional, professional and personal levels, and implement a motivation system at ILK.

At ILK, peer teaching observation is an integral part of the lecturers' competence development (SD-59). Peer cooperation is an integral part of the ILK's organisational quality culture, based on St. Ignatius of Loyola pedagogical paradigm. The meeting with the teaching staff indicates that peer observation is compulsory, and the staff normally get a timetable to choose sessions to observe.

The development of the ILK internationalisation is reflected in its strategic plan for 2021-2025 as well as in its internationalisation strategy for the implementation of the Erasmus + Higher Education Charter for 2021 – 2027 (SD-59). ILK lecturers mostly have at least B2 level in English. To support them to develop their English capability, the lecturers are provided with conditions to participate in foreign language courses.

The meeting with the teaching staff reveals that the teaching staff receive a range of support to develop their pedagogical, subject and research competencies. For instance, to support their pedagogical development, there are Ignatius pedagogical seminars to attend. The teaching staff are encouraged and financially supported to attend national and international conferences to present their research and develop their research competencies.

(2) Expert judgement/indicator analysis

Regarding the staff appraisal system, the meeting with the teaching staff indicates that the staff appraisal system is clearly organised, and they are fully aware of what to do and why it is necessary. The peer teaching observation is not ad hoc in ILK. Instead, it is an integral part of lecturers' competence development system and well understood by the lecturers. It is also consistent with peer cooperation organisational quality culture. The teaching staff express their satisfaction on the support they received from ILK to develop their pedagogical, subject and research competencies.

Based on the available evidence, the remote site visit and the additional information, the review panel **commends** that conditions to improve the competencies of teaching staff at ILK are excellent as it has a clear procedure guided by its organisational quality culture and well implemented which is demonstrated by the satisfaction of the teaching staff.

Strengths and weaknesses of this evaluation area:

(1) Strengths:

1. Conditions to improve the competences of teaching staff at ILK are excellent as it has a clear procedure guided by its organisational quality culture and well implemented which is demonstrated by the satisfaction of the teaching staff.

(2) Weaknesses:

None.

3.6. LEARNING FACILITIES AND RESOURCES

Study field learning facilities and resources should be evaluated according to the following criteria:

3.6.1. Evaluation of the suitability and adequacy of the physical, informational and financial resources of the field studies to ensure an effective learning process

(1) Factual situation

The institution provides all possible learning resources to ensure the completion of the academic programmes. The available tools are of high quality and meet the needs of the community. All classrooms, laboratories and reading rooms have wireless internet access, the large auditoriums have modern multimedia and video conferencing equipment. A virtual learning environment and collaboration system Moodle is implemented for ILK students and faculty. The institution has dedicated facilities for laboratory work and practice. The restaurant “Arrivee” is used for practical classes in food technology (p. 52, SER). The College community can use the 10 workstations in the library, further 25 workstations are provided elsewhere on campus. Students have access to tourism information and reservation systems.

(2) Expert judgement/indicator analysis

The College receives suggestions and requests from students regarding learning resources. The community can access the resources they need at any time. The available auditoriums are actively used for lectures. Students use the available library resources when doing research or writing reports. When physical defects are noticed, repairs are carried out.

3.6.2. Evaluation of the planning and upgrading of resources needed to carry out the field studies

(1) Factual situation

All learning resources used by the College are improved and updated from time to time. Students and teachers have the opportunity to express their views and suggestions on the use, renewal, connection, disposal of resources. This opportunity is being actively used. Teachers appropriately incorporate updated resources during lectures and introduce students to changed opportunities.

Resources are updated quickly and properly. The quality of learning resources is continuously observed.

(2) Expert judgement/indicator analysis

Students and faculty use updated resources. The administration presents a variety of options for working with these resources, but it would be good to update them more often.

Students know and are properly informed about the tools they have and can use. The college community is actively and willingly involved in the ongoing training.

The community has also confirmed that it is aware of the possibility of offering new learning resources. This opportunity is being used, but not very actively.

Strengths and weaknesses of this evaluation area:

(1) Strengths:

1. Selection and use of learning resources are adequate for HM programme delivery.

(2) Weaknesses:

1. Learning resources (physical and virtual) should become part of the institution's quality management processes to ensure regular updates.
2. Information about available library resources could be formalised better.

3.7. STUDY QUALITY MANAGEMENT AND PUBLIC INFORMATION

Study quality management and publicity shall be evaluated according to the following indicators:

3.7.1. Evaluation of the effectiveness of the internal quality assurance system of the studies

(1) Factual situation

The College's internal study quality management is ensured on the basis of the internal documents of the ILK: The Statute of ILK (2016), ILK Study Procedure (2021, No V-01), Description of ILK Study Quality Assurance Procedure (2020), Description of the Procedure for Improving the Quality of Studies (2019). Each document clearly defines the areas of study quality management. The SER identifies (p. 55) that the internal quality of studies and its assurance is managed by the ILK structure: study activities are administered and coordinated by the Academic Council, Study Programme Committees and Study Field Committees, ILK Study Quality Group, study programme leaders, and departments and its teams. The effectiveness of the quality system and the realistic assessment of the quality indicators were confirmed, during the remote site-visit, by the lecturers, who identified the indicators to measure student progress and the tools to assess the quality of studies. The lecturers stressed the importance of the documents that regulate the studies and the importance of the Code of Ethics for the formation of the students' values.

(2) Expert judgement/indicator analysis

The analysis of the main internal quality assurance documents shows that the quality assurance system is logical and regulated and is implemented at ILK. All the documents are publicly available on the College's website in Lithuanian. In the future, in order to attract students from other countries, it would be advisable to consider providing the documents in English as well.

3.7.2. Evaluation of the effectiveness of the involvement of stakeholders (students and other stakeholders) in internal quality assurance

(1) Factual situation

The involvement of stakeholders (students and other stakeholders) in internal quality assurance is systematically regulated in the document 'The Feedback Procedure for Improving the Quality of Studies' (2021, No V-10). It provides the following: a survey of first-year students (at the end of the first semester), a survey of students about teaching and studying subjects and a survey of lecturers about the study process during the semester (at the end of each semester); a survey of graduates on employment and career (12 months after graduation); a survey of employers after the student's professional placement; a survey of employers/social partners on directions for improvement of the curriculum, a survey of graduates on employability (6 months after graduation) etc. During the remote site-visit in the discussions with the lecturers, students, and social partners, it was found that the surveys are carried out on a regular basis. The SER states (p. 56) that all groups have the opportunity to make suggestions during meetings, discussions or through surveys. Cooperation with the social partners is organised through surveys, preparation of final theses, organising ILK career days, special discussions (e.g. on student placements, research projects), etc.

(2) Expert judgement/indicator analysis

The analysis of the documents and the data from the discussions during the remote site-visit suggests that ILK has developed research tools to obtain feedback from stakeholders at different levels. However, during the meeting discussions with the social partners, there was a mismatch between the information provided in the SER (p. 56): „The social partners provide proposals on the compliance of the study content with the needs of the market...” or „Representatives of employers participating in the activities of the Committee provide recommendations on the compliance of the study program”) and the position expressed by the social partners during the meeting. The social partners indicated that they are not directly involved in the development of the HM Programme. According to the social partners, they simply receive questions and ask to answer. It is therefore recommended that the Programme Development Committee consider ways and means to formalise the participation of the social partners in the direct development of the HM programme.

3.7.3. Evaluation of the collection, use and publication of information on studies, their evaluation and improvement processes and outcomes

(1) Factual situation

The College publishes key documents related to the studies on the College's website (<https://www.ilkk.lt/priemimas/>) and on the AIKOS system. The website also contains the main documents regulating studies (<https://www.ilkk.lt/studiju-tvarkos-ir-dokumentai/>), the quality performance documents (<https://www.ilkk.lt/veiklos-kokybe/>), and basic information on study programmes. Considerable attention is paid to the external evaluation aspect of ILK, with documents, details of visits, etc. The SER states (p. 57) that annual and periodic study analyses of the results of surveys, discussions with shareholders, statistics, etc. allow for a timely identification of study deficiencies and urgent actions. It means that ILK collects a large amount of feedback from different groups (students, teachers, graduates and social partners). The lecturers at the remote site-visit confirmed the statement in the SER (p.57) that the results of teaching quality assessment are used to improve the quality of teaching and the professional development of the lecturers.

According to the SER (p. 57), the results of surveys are published on ILK's website and sent by e-mail to the students and lecturers, as well as kept in Office 365 public folders, and presented at meetings.

(2) Expert judgement/indicator analysis

Analysis of the information provided on both the ILK's website and in the SER, allows to state that the main documents regulating studies or ensuring study quality are made accessible to the public. However, given that ILK collects a large amount of feedback on study programmes and, according to the SER, carries out analyses and reports on an annual basis, there is a lack of publicity of the summarised reports and analyses, and a lack of communication of the results of the internal evaluation and the ongoing changes to the ILK's community. This was confirmed by the social partners during the remote site-visit, who could not specify when they had attended such a meeting, and by the students, who admitted that they did not know whether there were any changes and what changes had taken place in the Hospitality Management programme, although the SER states that the students receive this information by email. Therefore, the ILK administration should consider ways to make public announcement of the results of the internal evaluation and development of studies more systematic and effective. It is expected that the preparation and presentation of such summary reports on the ILK's website would increase the publicity and accessibility of information.

3.7.4. Evaluation of the opinion of the field students (collected in the ways and by the means chosen by the SKVC or the HEI) about the quality of the studies at the HEI

(1) Factual situation

The College uses the following survey instruments to assess the students' perceptions of the quality of the studies: a survey of first-year students; a survey of students on the quality of

teaching; a survey of students returning from mobility abroad; a survey of students returning from professional practice and surveys of employers; a survey of final-year graduates; a survey of students with special needs. Student surveys are organised periodically and systematically by the department and conducted by the staff of the department (IT specialist, curators of the study program). According to the SER (p. 43) the analysis of the feedback results is performed at least once a year by the department implementing the study program and the study program committees. The SER does not indicate the number of participants in the surveys. Therefore, it can be stated that a formal procedure is established, but the lack of data makes it difficult to assess how it is actually implemented.

(2) Expert judgement/indicator analysis

After reviewing the content of the questionnaires, students have an opportunity to express their opinion on the quality of the studies, the peculiarities of the organisation of the studies, and to make suggestions for the improvement of the HM programme or a subject. Although no summarised surveys on students' satisfaction with their studies have been made publicly available, the students who participated in the remote site-visit discussion particularly emphasised their satisfaction with their studies and the quality of their studies, highlighting the support and close cooperation between the administration and the lecturers, the possibility of studying according to an individual plan, and the provision of flexible learning conditions to students who work or who have small children.

Strengths and weaknesses of this evaluation area:

(1) Strengths:

1. Clear regulation of the internal quality assurance system.
2. A variety of tools used to measure the quality of the studies covering all stakeholders in a comprehensive way.

(2) Weaknesses:

1. There is a lack of direct involvement of the social partners from the tourism sector in the development of the HM programme.
2. A lack of information on the publicity of the results of the internal evaluation and the improvement of study processes and outcomes.

IV. EXAMPLES OF EXCELLENCE

Core definition: Excellence means exhibiting exceptional characteristics that are, implicitly, not achievable by all.

N/A

V. RECOMMENDATIONS*

Evaluation Area	Recommendations for the Evaluation Area (study cycle)
Intended and achieved learning outcomes and curriculum	• The HM programme team should consider a wide range of strategies at national, European and international level to further develop its programme to ensure it conforms with the wider societal needs and the labour market, subsequently making its graduates more competitive in the industry and its programme more attractive. • The HM programme team should examine the subject knowledge which is included in the programme and add suitable knowledge statements to the current HM programme study results to ensure its study results include correct knowledge statements. • The HM programme team should consider (a) renaming different study subjects to ensure they reflect actual subject contents; (b) adding more hospitality related module contents; (c) rebranding the programme as Tourism and Hospitality Management to reflect the current module contents, so that it can ensure its programme title is consistent with the programme contents. • The HM programme team should reconsider its curriculum and add international contents (e.g., trends and issues in the international hospitality industry, human resource management issues in an international context, international marketing, etc) to the study plan to improve the international focus of the programme. • The HM programme teaching staff should make an annual review of different module descriptions to ensure up-to-date literature sources are recommended for students to read and study to ensure the newest knowledge is taught.
Links between science (art) and studies	• The institution must focus its research activities on the topic of the HM programme, in light of the suggestion of potentially rebranding the HM programme (above). With such rebranding, tourism research that is already incorporated would become relevant to the study program goals; otherwise, hospitality management research must be developed. • Research activities in the institution must be guided by a systematic approach. Such an approach should give fairly detailed guidance to the faculty on expectations and support for research (particularly in the HM field), and evaluation of

	publications as an output. Such systems require development. • The institution must provide factual and anecdotal evidence that supports the statements made in this section. For this, it is recommended that the institution develops a system of follow-up for all research activity and publication, and keeps detailed track of the quantity and quality of articles, chapters, and conference presentations. • The HM programme team needs to involve social partners in research activities through actively seeking input and research topics from the partners, and ensuring that within the HM program, there is enough expertise (faculty and/or student) to undertake hospitality management research. • The students of the HM programme come across as lacking skills in analysis and critical thinking. It is recommended that the program team enhances these competencies, in addition to hospitality-specific competencies, through offering students more opportunities to conduct industry research and present and argue for their findings.
Student admission and support	• Encourage students to apply actively for and use available support (students use the support they have, but some of them do not dare to use them or know where to turn; remind them several times a year about existing support and how to use it).
Teaching and learning, student performance and graduate employment	• The HM programme team should improve the description of the assessment system in the course (subject) description. The assessment system in the course descriptions should be more detailed, not only in terms of identifying the task and its weighting, but also in terms of describing the specific nature of the assessment task, the links to the objectives and the detailed assessment by assessment level. • The HM programme team should establish a formal procedure for the development and approval of course (subject) descriptions . • The students are not familiar with the procedure for appeals and complaints. Therefore, closer communication between the administration and students on this issue is recommended.
Teaching staff	• None

Learning facilities and resources	• The HM programme team should update learning resources more frequently (there is active use of available resources. More frequent updates are needed to ensure targeted results and information); • The HM programme team should encourage students to submit proposals for updating learning resources (students are aware of the opportunity available but do not make suggestions. It is recommended that learning resources best meet the needs of students and encourage them to submit proposals on their own).
Study quality management and public information	• It is recommended that the HM programme Development Committee consider ways and means to formalise the participation of the social partners in the direct development of the study programme. • It is recommended to consider ways to make public announcement of the results of the internal evaluation and development of studies more systematic and effective. It is expected that the preparation and presentation of such summary reports on the ILK's website would increase the publicity and accessibility of information.

*If the study field is going to be given negative evaluation (non-accreditation) instead of RECOMMENDATIONS main **arguments for negative evaluation** (non-accreditation) must be provided together with a **list of “must do” actions** in order to assure that students admitted before study field’s non-accreditation will gain knowledge and skills at least on minimum level.

VI. SUMMARY

Main positive and negative quality aspects of each evaluation area of the study field of Tourism and Leisure at Šv. Ignaco Lojolos kolegija:

Overall, the first cycle study programme under review is perceived as a well-managed programme, yet considerable shortcomings exist, which require the attention of the programme management team. Some of the recommendations raised in this report were flagged in the previous programme evaluation already, yet the programme management has not addressed the issues satisfactorily.

The review panel concludes that the aims and the learning outcomes of the revised HM programme conform to the needs of the society and the local labour market. Further, the programme aims and learning objectives directly correlate with the mission, objectives and strategic goals of ILK. However, the review panel recommends the development of strategies to broaden the educational impact on national, European and international level.

The programme review discovered significant shortcomings in the curriculum content. Although the review panel concludes that, the totality of HM programme ensures consistent development of competences of the students; concerns are raised in relation to subject specific knowledge and internationalisation. Therefore, the review panel recommends that the HM study programme team considers (a) renaming different study subjects to ensure they reflect actual subject contents; (b) adding more hospitality related module contents; (c) rebranding the programme as Tourism and Hospitality Management to reflect the current module contents.

In terms of research activities, it appears that faculty research that focuses on the core subject of the programme, hospitality management, is mostly missing. During the last review, a recommendation was to incentivize faculty to research more. It seems that such work has been seriously delayed. There is an urgent need to direct research activities to focus on hospitality management.

The previous panel also recommended ILK to clarify its Christian values among its stakeholders. In this respect, the institution seems to not have achieved the goal, considering that the values named by the institution and its faculty deviated from each other.

Whilst the admission process adheres to the legal requirements and is transparent, the review panel is concerned by the rising dropout-rates and recommends the management of ILK to develop a retention management procedure and implement this in the institution's quality management system. The recent change in focus on recruitment in rural areas raises the question on how the focus on regionalization on the one hand and internationalisation on the other shall be handled and potential areas of conflict shall be dealt with.

The process of the implementation of policies to ensure academic integrity, tolerance and non-discrimination is clear and regulated. ILK has a procedure for appeals and complaints, but the students are not familiar with it. Therefore, closer communication between the administration and the students on this issue is recommended. Flawed communication between stakeholders of the institution is a recurring issue and this requires the attention of the programme management team.

The review panel commends that conditions to improve the competencies of teaching staff at ILK are excellent as it has a clear procedure guided by its organisational quality culture and well implemented which is demonstrated by the satisfaction of the teaching staff.

Finally, the review panel noted a mismatch between the procedure for engaging social partners in the quality management processes of the HM programme (as outlined in the SER) and the actual engagement as reported by the social partners during the meetings. The HM programme management team is therefore advised to pay more attention to the formalised and systematic inclusion of social partners in all facts of the programme development.

Expert panel signatures:

Dr. Florian Aubke, (panel chairperson), member of academic community